

MARINA COAST WATER DISTRICT
2012 5-Year Rate Study and Financial Plan Proposals
Evaluation Matrix
9/11/2012

Provider	Rank	Experience/ Qualifications	# of Staff		Locale	Quality of Proposal	Comments/References
Carollo Engineers	3	+	4	\$61,811 + \$1,500 anticipated other direct expenses. Based on 358 hours @ an average hourly rate of \$173.	Walnut Creek, CA	+	Rate model developed by Carollo , SMART created in EXCEL will be tailored to the District. Worked with the District on the Design of the RUWAP Recycled Water Distribution System.
CDM Smith	4	+/V	4	\$42,250. Based on 324 hours @ an average hourly rate of \$128 and other direct costs of \$750.	Walnut Creek, CA	+	Bulk of Project Mgr experience outside CA & financial analysts on the project has 6 yrs experience or less. Had several comments on the District's PSA. Unable to reach references.
FCS Group	6	+/V	5	\$58,880 + \$1,000 estimated other direct costs. Based on 402 hours @ an average hourly rate of \$146.50. Will also charge \$3,000 per additional meeting other than what is proposed.	San Francisco, CA	+	Bulk of work to be done by project consultant (experience mostly in WA State) and by analysts w/ 6 yrs experience or less).
Glenn M. Reiter & Associates	7	+	3	\$44,100 + \$4,500 estimated other direct costs. Based on 282 hours @ an average hourly rate of \$156. No charge for meals.	San Diego, CA	√	Cost is lower than some due to less hours projected for the project. # of hours does not seem realistic.
Municipal Financial Services	1	+	2	\$59,600. 460 hours @ \$130/hr however, 10% will classified as contingency as they will only bill for actual hours. If contingency is not used, cost will be \$53,820 for 414 hours and may be less. All travel, printing and other costs are absorbed by MFS.	Walnut Creek, CA and Henderson, NV	+	Have local experience with water & wastewater rate studies (City of Watsonville, Soquel Creek WD, MRWPCA). Will only charge for actual hours worked.
NBS	5	+	6	\$58,940. 387 hours @ an average hourly rate of \$152. Includes hours of subcontractor Schaaf & Wheeler.	San Francisco, CA	+/V	Intends to provide 10 year plan instead of a 5 year plan. Will subcontract with Schaaf & Wheeler to provide engineering expertise.
Tuckfield & Associates	8	+	1	\$33,900. 232 hours @ \$135/hr + estimated other direct costs.	Newport Beach, CA	√	Hours are only an "estimated not to exceed". # of hours does not seem realistic. Had exceptions to the District's PSA.
Willdan Financial Services	2	+	5	\$59,920. Fixed Fee based on 377.5 hours @ an average hourly rate of \$159.	Temecula, CA	+	Rate model developed by Willdan , GUIDE created in EXCEL will be tailored to the District.